

Presentation at the Workshop on
TAX COMPETITION AND TAX AVOIDANCE:
IMPLICATIONS FOR GLOBAL DEVELOPMENT
 UNIVERSITY OF ESSEX, 1-2 JULY 2004

Estimating the Magnitude of Capital Flight
 Due To Abnormal Pricing in International Trade:
 The Russia-USA Case

Maria E. de Boyrie, New Mexico State University
 Simon J. Pak, Penn State University-Great Valley
 and John S. Zdanowicz, Florida International University

Russian Caviar at \$3/KG?

1999 Russia's Export to the U.S. - Abnormally Low Priced

Item	Value	Quantity		Price	Median Price	District	MO
CAVIAR	\$19,048	5,642	KG	\$3	\$260	LA	05
COOKING STOVES, Industrial	\$2,400	400	NC	\$6	\$2,281	LA	05
MOWERS, Tractor drawn or for Tractor mounting, not Rotary cutter type	\$11,469	122	NC	\$94	\$3,682	HSTN	11
GEAR BOXES for Passenger Car	\$37,320	6,496	NC	\$6	\$818	HSTN	12

Bicycle Tires at \$364/tire from the U.S. ?

1999 Russia's Import from the US - abnormally high priced

Item	Value	Quantity		Price	Median Price	District	MO
BICYCLES TIRES	\$2,548	7	NO	\$364	\$3.09	DETROIT	02
MEN'S OR BOYS' RAINCOATS - cotton	\$116,592	322	DOZ	\$362	\$40.46	NY CITY	03
WORN CLOTHING and OTHER WORN ARTICLES	\$150,000	347	KG	\$432	\$0.80	GTFALLS	05
BURGLAR ALARMS, Electric	\$105,954	7	NO	\$15,136	\$193.68	NY CITY	01
SWITCHES, PUSH-BUTTON, rated at < 10A, 1,000 V	\$179,080	10	NO	\$17,908	\$1.47	SEATTLE	07

Russia... 3

Abnormal Pricing in International Trade

- **May be related to:**
 - Capital flight
 - Import duty fraud
 - Income tax evasion / Transfer Pricing
 - Money laundering
- **Other Explanations:**
 - Clerical/Recording Errors
 - Product Heterogeneity for a given HS10 code
 - \$25,000 fax machine from Japan – prototype industrial sample

Russia... 4

Our Research

- Estimate the amount of capital flight from Russia to the U.S. through under-invoiced export and over-invoiced import during 1995 ~ 1999
- An empirical test: Is the capital flight due to a portfolio consideration in search of higher returns on wealth?
- Suggest an efficient Method of Inspection / Audit of Export and Import Transactions

Russia... 5

Effects of Abnormally Low Priced Export

(Russian Caviar at \$3/KG)

- Exporter (Russian):
 - Lower revenue and
 - Lower taxable income
- Importer (American):
 - Lower import duty
- Transfer wealth through excessively Low Priced goods
 - Capital outflow from Russia, the exporting country
 - Money laundering

Russia... 6

Effects of Abnormally High Priced Import

(Bicycle tires at \$364 from the U.S.)

- **Importer (Russian):**
 - Higher COG and higher import duty
 - Income tax saving > Increased import duty
 - Chen-Sunrider v. the U.S.
- **Exporter (American):**
 - Higher revenue & higher taxable income
 - May offset against negative profit
 - In some countries: Higher Export subsidy
 - Medical equipment export from Pakistan to the U.S.
- **Transfer wealth through Payments for excessively High Priced goods**
 - Capital outflow from Russia, the importing country
 - Money laundering

Russia... 7

Prior Estimates of Russian Capital Flight

- **Tikhomirov 1997**
 - Compared the Russian average contract prices with average world prices compiled by the gov't
 - Asserts that the actual capital flight is three to six time of \$35 ~ \$400 billion estimated for 1990 – 1995 by Russian Government
- **Abalkin & Whalley (1999)**
 - Used the balance of payment data
 - Estimated \$56-\$70 billion during 1992-93
 - Estimated \$17 billion/year during 1994 – 97

Russia... 8

Our Estimation: Data and Methodology

Direct estimate based on reported import & export transaction data

- Data Source
- Criteria for Price Abnormality
- Estimated Amount of Capital Flight / Income Shift
- Limitations of the Method

Russia... 9

DATA SOURCE

- U.S. Merchandise Trade Data from U.S. Census Bureau
- Two CD's each, monthly:

	Exports	Imports
Disk size (Dec 1999)	371 MB	641MB
Transactions(1999)	20,420,064	30,173,714
Records(Dec 1999)	1.1 million	1.5 million

- All Import (>\$1,250) and Export (>\$2,500) Transactions
 - Ten digit harmonized commodity code
 - 8,635 export codes in 1999
 - 17,179 import codes
 - Country – 233 countries in 1999
 - Customs district – 44 customs districts
 - Month
 - Quantity & Dollar value

Russia... 10

Criteria for Price Abnormality

A Price Filter – Global Price Matrix

- **Global Price Matrix is constructed from the data:**
 - For each commodity code and each country
The average price, the standard deviation, upper- and lower quartile prices
 - Upper bound = the mean + a x STD or **Upper Quartile Price**
 - Lower bound = the mean - a x STD or **Lower Quartile Price**
 - Total Number of Cells in 1999
= (8,635 + 17,179) x (233+1) = 6.04 million cells
- **Why use Upper- and Lower Quartiles?**
 - IRS Reg 482 on transfer pricing
 - Price Matrix for Mexico: **Import** and **Export**

Russia... 11

Estimation of Income Shifted from Russia to the US

- **Abnormality Criteria**
 - imports at prices exceeding the import **upper** quartile price;
 - exports at prices below the export **lower** quartile price
- **Dollar value of over or under invoicing**
 - Dollar value of deviations from the inter-quartile prices
 - $\text{Max}(0, (\text{Import Price} - \text{upper quartile price}) * \text{Qty})$
 - $\text{Max}(0, (\text{Lower quartile price} - \text{Export Price}) * \text{Qty})$
 - 60 monthly data sets during 1995 -1996
 - Every import and export transaction between Russia and the United States for every month

Russia... 12

Estimated Income Shifted from Russia to the US

All Items - based on
US-World Upper/Lower Quartile Prices
 (\$ million)

	Exports	Imports	Total
1995	736	292	1,028
1996	632	380	1,012
1997	662	364	1,026
1998	679	331	1,010
1999	4,533	313	4,847
Five Year Total	7,242	1,681	8,923

Russia... 13

Estimated Income Shifted from Russia to the US

All Items - based on
US-Russia Upper/Lower Quartile Prices
 (\$ million)

	Exports	Imports	Total
1995	131	129	260
1996	262	166	428
1997	99	146	245
1998	164	213	377
1999	495	55	551
Five Year Total	1,152	709	1,861

Russia... 14

Income Shifted from Russia to the US

TOP 25 ITEMS IN RUSSIA-US TRADE (\$ million)

	US-World Upper/Lower Quartile Prices			US-Russia Upper/Lower Quartile Prices		
	Exports	Imports	Total	Exports	Imports	Total
1995	\$457	\$128	\$585	\$107	\$72	\$179
1996	\$397	\$222	\$619	\$235	\$110	\$345
1997	\$416	\$149	\$565	\$73	\$101	\$174
1998	\$388	\$154	\$543	\$123	\$158	\$281
1999	\$4,251	\$230	\$4,481	\$459	\$36	\$495
Five Year Total	\$5,909	\$884	\$6,793	\$997	\$477	\$1,475
	<i>Under Invoiced</i>	<i>Over Invoiced</i>		<i>Under Invoiced</i>	<i>Over Invoiced</i>	

Russia... 15

Income Shifted from Russia to the US

TOP 25 ITEMS IN RUSSIA-US TRADE (%) (The Income shifted through the top 25 items as a percent OF THE INCOME SHIFTED THROUGH ALL ITEMS)

	US-World Upper/Lower			US-Russia Upper/Lower		
	Exports	Imports	Total	Exports	Imports	Total
1995	62%	44%	57%	82%	56%	69%
1996	63%	58%	61%	90%	66%	81%
1997	63%	41%	55%	74%	69%	71%
1998	57%	47%	54%	75%	74%	75%
1999	94%	74%	92%	93%	65%	90%
Five Year Total	82%	53%	76%	87%	67%	79%

TOP 25 ITEMS account for over 75% of Total
Income Shifted

Russia... 16

Limitations

- Heterogeneity for a given HS10
- Aggregated data:
 - By HS10, Month, Country, and Customs District
- No distinction between
 - Related party transactions vs unrelated party transactions
- Current pilot research project:
 - Examines each transaction - no aggregation
 - Use information on related party vs. unrelated party transactions

Russia... 17

Expected Outcome of the Pilot Project

- Profiles of Importers and/or Exporters with a high degree of abnormal pricing
- Identify Commodity or Commodity groups with a high degree of abnormal pricing
- Difference in the degree of abnormal pricing between related-party transactions and unrelated-party transactions
- Policy recommendations based on the findings
 - Uniform commodity classification for both imports and exports?
 - Auditing procedure for inbound and outbound cargos?
 - Effective use of the Exp/Imp data in tax audits ?

Russia... 18

Why Capital Flight?

- Money laundering
- Tax evasion
- Higher Returns on Wealth Portfolio

Russia... 19

In Search of Higher Returns on Wealth?

- Intuitively one might move wealth to foreign countries due to:
 - Higher foreign interest rates
 - Lower domestic interest rates
 - Overvalued domestic currency
 - Higher domestic inflation
- Two portfolio models for capital flights
 - **Pastor model (1990):** Pastor, Manuel Jr, 1990, "Capital Flight from Latin America," *World Development*, 18, 1, 1-18.
 - **Cuddington model (1986):** Cuddington, John T., 1986, *Capital Flight: Estimates, Issues, and Explanations*, Princeton Studies in International Finance (Princeton, New Jersey).

Russia... 20

Capital Flight – Pastor Model

- Capital Flight: Investors' transfer of domestic assets to foreign assets
 - Financial Assets or
 - investments in real productive activity
- Explanatory Variables
 - change in inflation rate
 - financial incentive for capital flight: (Interest rate differential adj'd for FX rate change)
 - degree of overvaluation: (Avg REER) – (Equil. REER)

Russia... 21

Pastor Model and Variables def's

$$CF = f(CHINF, FINC^1, OVAL) \quad (1)$$

$$CF = f(CHINF, FINC^2, OVAL) \quad (2)$$

CF = Capital Flight

CHINF = Change in inflation rate, calculated as the difference in logarithms of consumer price indexes.

FINC = Financial incentive for capital flight measured as

$FINC^1 = (i^{US} - (i - \dot{e}))$ following Pastor's definition and

$FINC^2 = \ln(1 + i^{US}) - \ln(1 + i) + \ln(e) - \ln(\dot{e})$ following Dolley's definition

i^{US} = The rate paid on US Treasury bills

i = Domestic interest rate, Deposit rate

e = Ratio of local currency to dollar

\dot{e} = Rate of change of the exchange rate (local currency to dollar)

OVAL = The degree of overvaluation measured as the average real exchange rate for the current year relative to an equilibrium value (please see the definition for R in Cuddington's model)

e^r = Real exchange rate

P = Domestic price level – producer price index for Russia

P^{US} = US Price level - producer price index for the US

Russia... 22

Capital Flight – Cuddington Model

- a “standard three-asset portfolio adjustment model”
 - domestic financial assets
 - domestic inflation hedges- land, consumer durables
 - foreign financial assets.
- defines capital flight “the year-to-year increase in domestic holdings of foreign financial assets
- The explanatory variables:
 - domestic interest rate,
 - domestic inflation rate, and
 - foreign interest rate augmented by the expected rate of depreciation of the domestic currency.

Russia... 23

Cuddington Model and Var's def's

$$KF_t = a_0 + a_1\pi_t + a_2r_t + a_3(r_t^* + x_t) \quad (3)$$

KF = Capital Flight

π = Domestic inflation rate, calculated as the ratio of the logarithms of consumer price indexes (i.e., $\log(CPI / CPI^1)$).

r = Domestic interest rate, Deposit rate

r^* = Foreign interest rate, T-bill rate

x = Expected rate of depreciation of the domestic currency, calculated as $x = a(REER_t - R)$

REER = Real effective exchange rate. Since IMF- International Statistics does not publish the real effective exchange rate for Russia we estimated this

variable using Pastor's definition, i.e., $e^r = \frac{P}{e \times P^{IS}}$

R = Equilibrium rate. We are using the value of the real effective exchange rate for 1995 as the equilibrium rate. This is the year IMF-International Statistics uses as its index year.

Russia... 24

Additional Data Source

International Financial Statistics (IFS)

- Monthly data from January 1995 to December 1999
- The variables utilized include
 - interest rate (i.e., deposit rate)
 - exchange rate
 - consumer price index and
 - the producer price index for Russia and the United States.

Russia... 25

Regression Results

The Determinants of Capital Flight for Russia

- Regressions using both models
 - Dependent Variables: Capital flight in (\$ amount) & (% of Trade Volume)
 - Independent Variables: No lag, lagged one period, lagged two periods
 - Total of 18 equations estimated
- Most Equations – statistically insignificant
 - The regression results do not support the hypothesis that Capital Flights are due to a portfolio consideration
- A few equations with significant variables
 - But wrong signs!
 - Overvalued Currency in Pastor model – negative sign
 - Expected Rate of Currency Depreciation in Cuddington Model – negative sign

Russia... 26

Regression Results

The Determinants of Capital Flight for Russia

Specification	Variables								R ² /R ² Adj.
	CHINF	FINC1	FINC2	OVAL	r	B	r*	x	
4 Pastor's Model 1 month lag	0.2234 (1.59)	-0.0474 (-1.40)‡		-0.2148 (-2.10)§					0.111/ 0.053
5 Pastor's Model 1 month lag	0.199 (1.49)‡		-0.0489 (-1.42)‡	-0.2105 (-2.07)§					0.111/ 0.053
9 Cuddington's Model 2 month lag					0.0003 (0.96)	-0.2327 (-1.34)‡	0.0802 (1.52)‡	-0.4805 (-2.38)§	0.129/ 0.052

Note: Specifications 4 & 5 are obtained using Pastor's definition. Specification 9 is obtained using Cuddington's model. The dependent variable is defined as a percentage of total trade.

t-values are reported in parentheses below the coefficient estimated, *d.f.* = 50.

§ Significant at the 2% level (two-tailed test)

‡ Significant at the 5% level (two-tailed test)

‡ Significant at the 10% level (two-tailed test)

FINC1 = FINC using Pastor's definition

FINC2 = FINC using Dooley's definition

Russia... 27

Regression Results

- It appears the capital flight from Russia to the U.S. is motivated by:
 - Income Tax avoidance and/or
 - Money Laundering

Russia... 28

How can Abnormal Pricing be Detected?

- Optimal level of inspection/audit may be determined by comparing
 - the expected marginal benefit
 - the expected marginal cost
- Possible Approach:
 - No inspection? – zero cost and zero benefit
 - Inspection of all transactions?
 - Random inspection?
 - Use of Systematic Filters such as the price filter
 - EG: Top 25 items: over 75% of capital flight between 1995 and 1999

Russia... 29

CONCLUSION

- Capital Flight from Russia to the U.S.
 - Based on transaction data in the U.S. Merchandise Trade Database
 - Estimated amount: \$1.86 billion ~ \$8.92 billion during 1995 ~ 1999
 - Regression results indicate capital flight may be motivated:
 - Other than by portfolio consideration
 - Such as by income tax avoidance and money laundering
- Extension of the study:
 - Estimate capital flight through trade **from Russia to ALL countries** using Russian import and export database

Russia... 30